

Preparation for Class on Connecting Chapters in Mishnah

1. Read (cursorily) Berakhot Chapters 4-5 ([here](#), [here](#)) and summarize – what aspects of prayer are discussed in chapter 4 and which in chapter 5?
 - a. What points of contact do you detect between these two chapters (aside from the shared subject of prayer)?
2. See the opening mishnahs of Shabbat Chapters 2, 4, 5, and 6 (see [here](#), [here](#), [here](#), and [here](#)) – what connects these chapters?
 - a. What general topics are discussed in these four chapters? Can you detect topical connections between them?
3. Read (cursorily) the first two chapters of Rosh Hashanah ([here](#), [here](#)) – which aspect of Sanctifying the New Moon is emphasized in each chapter?

Connecting Chapters

Segue: Berakhot Chapter 4

א תפלת השחר, עד חצות. רבי יהודה אומר, עד ארבע שעות. תפלת המנחה עד הערב. רבי יהודה אומר, עד פלג המנחה. תפלת הערב אין לה קבע. ושל מוספין כל היום. רבי יהודה אומר, עד שבע שעות.

According to the Rabbis, **the morning prayer** may be recited **until noon**. **Rabbi Yehuda says:** It may be recited only **until four hours** after sunrise. According to the Rabbis, **the afternoon prayer** may be recited **until the evening**. **Rabbi Yehuda says:** It may be recited only **until the midpoint of the afternoon** [*pelag haminḥa*], i.e., the midpoint of the period that begins with the sacrifice of the daily afternoon offering and ends at nightfall, which is the end of the afternoon.

The evening prayer may be recited throughout the night and **is not fixed** to a specific hour. According to the Rabbis, **the additional prayer** may be recited **all day**. **Rabbi Yehuda says:** It may be recited only **until seven hours** after sunrise.

ב רבי גחוניא בן הקנה היה מתפלל בכניסתו לבית המדרש וביציאתו תפלה קצרה. אמרו לו, מה מקום לתפלה זו. אמר להם, בכניסתי אני מתפלל שלא תארע תקלה על ידי, וביציאתי אני נותן הודיה על חלקי.

Rabbi Nehunya ben Hakana would recite a brief prayer upon his entrance into the study hall and upon his exit. They said to him: The study hall is not a dangerous place that would warrant a prayer when entering and exiting, so **what room is there for this prayer? He said to them: Upon my entrance, I pray that no mishap will transpire caused by me in the study hall. And upon my exit, I give thanks for my portion.**

ג רבן גמליאל אומר, בכל יום מתפלל אדם שמנה עשרה. רבי יהושע אומר, מעין שמנה עשרה. רבי עקיבא אומר, אם שגורה תפלתו בפיו, יתפלל שמנה עשרה. ואם לאו, מעין שמנה עשרה.

Rabban Gamliel says: Each and every day a person recites the prayer of **eighteen blessings**. **Rabbi Yehoshua says:** A short prayer is sufficient, and one only recites an **abridged** version of the prayer of **eighteen blessings**. **Rabbi Akiva says** an intermediate opinion: **If he is fluent in his prayer, he recites the prayer of eighteen blessings, and if not,** he need only recite an **abridged** version of the prayer of **eighteen blessings**.

ד רבי אליעזר אומר, העושה תפלתו קבע, אין תפלתו תקנונים. רבי יהושע אומר, המהלך במקום סכנה, מתפלל תפלה קצרה. אומר, הושע השם את עמך את שארית ישראל, בכל פרשת העבור יהיו צרכיהם לפניך. ברוך אתה ה' שומע תפלה.

Rabbi Eliezer says: One whose prayer is fixed, his prayer is not supplication and is flawed. The Gemara will clarify the halakhic implications of this flaw.

Rabbi Yehoshua says: One who cannot recite a complete prayer because he is walking in a place of danger, recites a brief prayer and says: Redeem, Lord, Your people, the remnant of Israel, at every transition [*parashat ha'ibur*], the meaning of which will be discussed in the Gemara. **May their needs be before You. Blessed are You, Lord, Who listens to prayer.**

ה היתה רוכב על התמור, ירד. ואם אינו יכול לירד, יתזיר את פניו, ואם אינו יכול להזיז את פניו, יבנו את לבו פנגד בית קדש הקדשים.

While praying, one must face toward the direction of the Holy Temple. **One who was riding on a donkey should dismount and pray** calmly. **If he is unable to dismount, he should turn his face** toward the direction of the Temple. **If he is unable to turn his face,** it is sufficient that **he focus his heart opposite the Holy of Holies.**

ו הִיָּה יוֹשֵׁב בְּסָפִינָה אוֹ בְּקָרוֹן אוֹ בְּאַסְדָּה, יִכּוֹן אֶת לְבוֹ כְּנֹגֵד בֵּית קֹדֶשׁ הַקְּדוּשִׁים.

Similarly, **one who was traveling in a ship or on a wagon or on a raft [asda]** and is unable to turn and face in the direction of Jerusalem, **should focus his heart opposite the Holy of Holies.**

ז רַבִּי אֶלְעָזָר בֶּן עֲזַרְיָה אוֹמֵר, אֵין תְּפִלַּת הַמוֹסָפִין אֶלָּא בְּחֵבֶר עִיר. וְחֻכְמִים אוֹמְרִים, בְּחֵבֶר עִיר וְשֵׁלָא בְּחֵבֶר עִיר. רַבִּי יְהוּדָה אוֹמֵר מִשְׁמוֹ, כָּל מְקוֹם שֶׁיֵּשׁ חֵבֶר עִיר, הִיִּחִיד פְּטוֹר מִתְּפִלַּת הַמוֹסָפִין.

Rabbi Elazar ben Azarya says: The additional prayer is only recited in a city where there is a quorum of ten [hever ir]. The Rabbis say: One may recite the additional prayer with a hever ir or without a hever ir. Rabbi Yehuda says another opinion in his name, the name of Rabbi Elazar ben Azarya: Any place where there is a hever ir, an individual is completely exempt from reciting the additional prayer.

Berakhot Chapter 5

א אֵין עוֹמְדִין לְהִתְפַּלֵּל אֶלָּא מִתּוֹךְ כַּכָּד רֵאשׁ. חֻסְדִּים הִרְאִישׁוּנִים הָיוּ שׁוֹהִים שְׁעָה אַחַת וּמִתְפַּלְלִים, כְּדִי שִׁיכְנוּ אֶת לְבָבָם לְמָקוֹם. אֶפְלוּ הַמְּלָךְ שׁוֹאֵל בְּשִׁלּוּמוֹ, לֹא יִשְׁיכְנוּ. וְאֶפְלוּ נֹחַשׁ כְּרוֹף עַל עֵקֶבוֹ, לֹא יִפְסִיק.

One may only stand and begin to pray from an approach of gravity and submission. There is a tradition that **the early generations of pious men would wait one hour**, in order to reach the solemn frame of mind appropriate for prayer, **and then pray, so that they would focus their hearts toward their Father in Heaven.** Standing in prayer is standing before God and, as such, **even if the king greets him, he should not respond to him; and even if a snake is wrapped on his heel, he should not interrupt his prayer.**

ב מִזְכִּירֵין גְּבוּרוֹת גְּשָׁמִים בְּתַחֲנִית הַמַּתִּים, וְשׁוֹאֲלִין הַגְּשָׁמִים בְּכַרְפַּת הַשָּׁנִים, וְהַבְּדֵלָה בְּחוֹגֵן הַדְּעַת. רַבִּי עֲקִיבָא אוֹמֵר, אוֹמְרָה בְּרַכָּה רְבִיעִית בְּפָנֵי עֲצָמָה. רַבִּי אֶלְעָזָר אוֹמֵר, בְּהוֹדָאָה.

One mentions the might of the rains and recites: He makes the wind blow and the rain fall, **in the second blessing of the Amidá prayer, the blessing of the revival of the dead. And the request for rain:** And grant dew and rain as a blessing, **in the ninth blessing of the Amidá prayer, the blessing of the years. And the prayer of distinction [havdala],** between the holy and the profane recited in the evening prayer following Shabbat and festivals, **in the fourth blessing of the Amidá prayer: Who graciously grants knowledge. Rabbi Akiva says: Havdala is recited as an independent fourth blessing. Rabbi Eliezer says that it is recited in the seventeenth blessing of the Amidá prayer, the blessing of thanksgiving.**

ג הָאוֹמֵר עַל קֵן צְפוּר גִּיעֵו רַחֲמִיךָ, וְעַל טוֹב יִזְכֵּר שְׁמֶךָ, מוֹדִים מוֹדִים, מִשְׁתַּקִּין אוֹתוֹ. הָעוֹבֵר לְפָנֵי הַתִּיבָה וְשָׁעָה, יַעֲבֹר אַחַר תַּחֲתָיו, וְלֹא יִהְיֶה סָרְבֵן בְּאוֹתָהּ שְׁעָה. מִצִּין הוּא מִתְחִיל, מִתְחַלֵּת הַבְּרַכָּה שְׁשָׁעָה בָּהּ.

One who recites in his supplication: Just as **Your mercy is extended to a bird's nest**, as You have commanded us to send away the mother before taking her chicks or eggs (Deuteronomy 22:6–7), so too extend Your mercy to us; **and one who recites: May Your name be mentioned with the good** or one who recites: **We give thanks, we give thanks** twice, they **silence him**.

This mishna and the next one deal with the communal prayer leader. **(If one says: “May the good bless You,” this is a path of heresy.) One who is passing before the ark**, as prayer leader, **and erred, another should immediately pass in his place, and at that moment, this replacement should not refuse** in the interest of courtesy. The *Amida* prayer was interrupted and he should replace him as quickly as possible. **From where does the replacement commence? From the beginning of the blessing in which the former had erred.**

ד הַעוֹבֵר לְפָנֵי הַתִּיבָה, לֹא יַעֲנֶה אַחֵר הַכֹּהֲנִים אָמֵן, מִפְּנֵי הַטְּרוּף. וְאִם אֵין שָׁם כֹּהֵן אֶלָּא הוּא, לֹא יִשָּׂא אֶת כַּפָּיו. וְאִם הִבְטַחְתּוּ שֶׁהוּא נוֹשֵׂא אֶת כַּפָּיו וְחוֹזֵר לְתַפְלֵתוֹ, רִשְׁאֵי.

One who passes before the ark should not respond amen after the blessing of the **priests, because of potential confusion**. Since the mishna is describing a situation in which he was praying without a prayer book, responding amen would interrupt the order of the prayer and potentially lead him to begin a different blessing. For this reason, even **if there is no priest other than the communal prayer leader, he does not lift his hands** to bless the people, lest he become confused. **And, however, if he is certain that he can lift his hands and resume his prayer** without becoming confused, **he is permitted** to recite the blessing.

ה הַמְתַּפְּלֵל וְטָעָה, סִימָן רַע לוֹ. וְאִם שָׁלַיַח צְבוּר הוּא, סִימָן רַע לְשׁוֹלְחָיו, מִפְּנֵי שֶׁשְׁלוּחוֹ שָׁל אֶדָם כְּמוֹתוֹ. אָמְרוּ עָלָיו עַל רַבִּי חֲנִינָא בֶן דּוּסָא, כְּשֶׁהָיָה מְתַפְּלֵל עַל הַחוֹלִים וְאוֹמֵר, זֶה חַי וְזֶה יָמָת. אָמְרוּ לוֹ, מִיֵּינָן אַתָּה יוֹדֵעַ. אָמַר לָהֶם, אִם נִשְׁגַּרְרָה תַּפְלֵתִי בְּפִי, יוֹדֵעַ אֲנִי שֶׁהוּא מְקַבֵּל. וְאִם לֹא, יוֹדֵעַ אֲנִי שֶׁהוּא מְטַרֵף.

One who prays and realizes that he erred in his prayer, it is a **bad omen for him**; it indicates to him that his prayer was not accepted. **And if he who erred is the communal prayer leader, it is a bad omen for those who sent him, because a person's agent has legal status equivalent to his own**. On a similar note, **they said about Rabbi Hanina ben Dosa that he would pray on behalf of the sick and immediately after his prayer he would say: This one shall recover from his illness and live and this one shall die**. When **they said to him: From where do you know? He said to them: If my prayer is fluent in my mouth** as I recite it and there

are no errors, **I know that my prayer is accepted. And if not, I know that my prayer is rejected.**

פרק ד	פרק ה
יכין את לבו כנגד בית קודש הקדשים (ד-ה)	כדי שיכוונו את לבם למקום (א)
אם שגרה תפילתו בפיו (ג)	אם שגרה תפילתי בפיו (ה)
מקום (מילת מפתח: ב, ד, ז)	כדי שיכוונו את לבם למקום (א)

Anaphora: Shabbat – Openings of Chapters 2, 4, 5, 6

- ב:א בַּמָּה מְדַלְקִין וּבַמָּה אֵין מְדַלְקִין
 ד:א בַּמָּה טוֹמְנִין וּבַמָּה אֵין טוֹמְנִין
 ה:א בַּמָּה יוֹצְאֵה וּבַמָּה אֵינָה יוֹצְאֵה
 ו:א בַּמָּה אֵשֶׁה יוֹצְאֵה וּבַמָּה אֵינָה יוֹצְאֵה.

Topics of Chapters 1, 3, 7

א:א יציאות השבת שמתים ששהן ארבע בַּפְּנִים, ושמתים ששהן ארבע בחוץ. כיצד. העני עומד בחוץ ובעל הבית בַּפְּנִים

The acts of **carrying out** from a public domain into a private domain or vice versa, which are prohibited **on Shabbat**, are primarily **two** basic actions **that comprise four** cases from the perspective of a person **inside** a private domain, **and two** basic actions **that comprise four** cases from the perspective of a person **outside**, in a public domain.

א:ה בית שמאי אומרים, אין שורין דיו וסממנים וכרשינים, אלא כְּדֵי שְׂיִשְׁוֹרוּ מִבְּעוֹד יוֹם. ובית הלל מתירין.

In this mishna there is a fundamental dispute between Beit Hillel and Beit Shammai: Must one begin refraining from actions prohibited on Shabbat on Shabbat eve? Or, may one initiate an action prior to Shabbat, even if he knows that it will continue on its own on Shabbat itself? These are the details of that dispute: **Beit Shammai say: One may only soak dry ink in water and dry plants, which produce dyes, in water and vetch for animal food to soften them in water on Shabbat eve, adjacent to Shabbat, if there is clearly sufficient time for them to soak for their designated purpose while it is still day, before Shabbat begins, and their continued soaking on Shabbat will have no effect. And Beit Hillel permit doing so.**

א:א כִּירָה שֶׁהִסְיָקוּהָ בְּקֶשׁ וּבִגְבֻבָּא, נוֹתְנִים עָלֶיהָ תְּבַשְׂלִי. בְּגִפְתָּ וּבְעֵצִים, לֹא יִתֵּן עַד שְׂיִגְרֶה

With regard to a stove that was lit on Shabbat eve with straw or with rakings, scraps collected from the field, one may place a pot of cooked food atop it on Shabbat. The fire in this stove was certainly extinguished while it was still day, as both straw and rakings are materials that burn quickly. However, if the stove was lit with pomace, pulp that remains from sesame seeds, olives, and the like after the oil is squeezed from them, and if it was lit with wood, one may not place a pot atop it on Shabbat until he sweeps the coals from the stove while it is still day or until he places ashes on the coals

ז:ב אבות מלאכות ארבעים חסר אהת

The primary categories of labor prohibited on Shabbat, which number forty-less-one

Epiphora: Rosh Hashanah Chapters 1-2

א:ט מי שראה את החדש ואינו יכול להלך, מוליכין אותו על הקמור, אפלו במטה. ואם צודה להם, לוקחין בידם מקלות. ואם היתה דרך רחוקה, לוקחין בידם מזונות, שעל מהלך לילה ג' יום מחללין את השבת (ויזצאין לעדות החדש, ששנאמר: אלה מועדי ה' אשר תקראו אותם במועדם (ויקרא כ"ג:ד)).

With regard to one who saw the new moon but is unable to go to Jerusalem by foot because he is sick or has difficulty walking, others may bring him on a donkey or even in a bed, even on Shabbat if necessary. And if the witnesses are concerned that bandits may be lying in wait for them along the road, they may take clubs or other weapons in their hands, even on Shabbat.

And if it was a long journey to Jerusalem, they may take sustenance with them, although it is ordinarily prohibited to carry on Shabbat, since for a distance of a walk of a night and a day, the witnesses may desecrate Shabbat and go out to give testimony to determine the start of the month. This is as it is stated: "These are the Festivals of the Lord, sacred gatherings, which you shall declare in their seasons" (Leviticus 23:4). This teaches that, in all cases, the Festivals must be fixed at their proper times, even if it entails the transgression of Torah prohibitions.

ב:ט מעשה שבאו שנים ואמרו, ראינוהו שחרית במזרח וערבית במערב. אמר רבי יוחנן בן גוריון, עדי שקר הם. שבאו ליבנה קבלו רבן גמליאל. ועוד באו שנים ואמרו, ראינוהו בזמנו, ובליל עבורו לא נראה, וקבלו רבן גמליאל. אמר רבי דוסא בן הרפינס, עדי שקר הו, היאך מעידין על האשה שילדה, ולמחר פרסה בין שניה. אמר לו רבי יהושע, רואה אני את דבריך.

Rabban Gamliel had a diagram of the different forms of the moon drawn on a tablet that hung on the wall of his attic, which he would show to the laymen who came to testify about the new moon but were unable to describe adequately what they had seen. And he would say to them: Did you see a form like this or like this?

There was an **incident in which two witnesses came to testify about the new moon, and they said: We saw the waning moon in the morning in the east, and that same day we saw the new moon in the evening in the west. Rabbi Yohanan ben Nuri said: They are false witnesses,** as it is impossible to see the new moon so soon after the last sighting of the waning moon. However, **when they arrived in Yavne, Rabban Gamliel accepted them** as witnesses without concern.

And there was another incident in which two witnesses came and said: We saw the new moon at its anticipated time, i.e., on the night of the thirtieth day of the previous month; however, on the following night, i.e., the start of the thirty-first, which is often the determinant of a full, thirty-day month, it was not seen. And nevertheless Rabban Gamliel accepted their testimony and established the New Moon on the thirtieth day.

Rabbi Dosa ben Horkinas disagreed and said: They are false witnesses; how can witnesses testify that a woman gave birth and the next day her belly is between her teeth, i.e., she is obviously still pregnant? If the new moon was already visible at its anticipated time, how could it not be seen a day later? Rabbi Yehoshua said to him: I see the logic of your statement; the New Moon must be established a day later.

שלח לו רבן גמליאל, גזרני עליך שתבא אצלי במקלה ובמעוטיה ביום הכפורים שחל להיות בחשבונך. הלה ומצאו רבי עקיבא מצר, אמר לו, יש לי ללמוד שכל מה שעשה רבן גמליאל עשוי, שנאמר: אלה מועדי ?? מקראי קדש אשר תקראו אתם (ויקרא כ"ג:ד'), בין בזמנן בין שלא בזמנן, אין לי מועדות אלא אלו. בא לו אצל רבי דוסא בן הרפינס, אמר לו, אם באין אנו לדון אחר בית דינו של רבן גמליאל, צריכין אנו לדון אחר כל בית דין ובית דין שעמד מימות משה ועד עכשיו, שנאמר: ויעל משה ואהרן נדב ואביהוא ושבעים מזקני ישראל (שמות כ"ד:ט). ולמה לא נתפרשו שמותן של זקנים, אלא ללמד, שכל שלשה ושלשה שעמדו בית דין על ישראל, הרי הוא כבית דינו של משה. נטל מקלו ומעוטיו בידו, והלה ליבנה אצל רבן גמליאל ביום שחל יום הכפורים להיות בחשבונך. עמד רבן גמליאל ונשקו על ראשו, אמר לו, בא בשלום, רבי ותלמידי, רבי בהקמה, ותלמידי ששקבלת דברי.

Upon hearing that Rabbi Yehoshua had challenged his ruling, **Rabban Gamliel sent a message to him: I decree against you that you must appear before me with**

your staff and with your money on the day on which Yom Kippur occurs according to your calculation; according to my calculation, that day is the eleventh of Tishrei, the day after Yom Kippur.

Rabbi Akiva went and found Rabbi Yehoshua distressed that the head of the Great Sanhedrin was forcing him to desecrate the day that he maintained was Yom Kippur. In an attempt to console him, Rabbi Akiva **said to Rabbi Yehoshua: I can learn from a verse that everything that Rabban Gamliel did** in sanctifying the month is done, i.e., it is valid. **As it is stated: “These are the appointed seasons of the Lord, sacred convocations, which you shall proclaim in their season” (Leviticus 23:4).** This verse indicates that **whether** you have proclaimed them **at their proper time** or **whether** you have declared them **not at their proper time, I have only these Festivals** as established by the representatives of the Jewish people.

Rabbi Yehoshua then **came to Rabbi Dosa ben Horkinas, who said to him: If we come to debate** and question the rulings of **the court of Rabban Gamliel, we must debate** and question the rulings of every court that has stood from the days of **Moses until now. As it is stated: “Then Moses went up, and Aaron, Nadav and Avihu, and seventy of the Elders of Israel” (Exodus 24:9).** **But why were the names of these seventy Elders not specified? Rather,** this comes to teach that every set of **three judges that stands as a court over the Jewish people** has the same status as **the court of Moses.** Since it is not revealed who sat on that court, apparently it is enough that they were official judges in a Jewish court.

When Rabbi Yehoshua heard that even Rabbi Dosa ben Horkinas maintained that they must submit to Rabban Gamliel’s decision, **he took his staff and his money in his hand, and went to Yavne to Rabban Gamliel on the day on which Yom Kippur occurred according to his own calculation.** Upon seeing him, **Rabban Gamliel stood up and kissed him on his head. He said to him: Come in peace, my teacher and my student.** You are **my teacher in wisdom,** as Rabbi Yehoshua was wiser than anyone else in his generation, **and you are my student, as you accepted my statement,** despite your disagreement.

Parallels between Endings of Chapters 1 and 2 (Epiphora)

פרק א משנה ט

אלה מועדי יי אשר תקראו אותם –

במועדם

לוקחין בידם מקלות

ואיננו יכול להלך/מהלך לילה ויום

פרק ב משנה ט

אלה מועדי יי מקראי קדש, אשר תקראו אתם..."

בין בזמנן בין שלא בזמנן

נטל מקלו בידו/ שתבוא אצלי במקלך

הלך ומצאו מיצר/ והלך ליבנה אצל ר"ג